

## NALANDA MASTERS COURSE IN BUDDHIST PHILOSOPHY

Dedicated to the long life and Fulfillment of all the wishes Of

#### HIS HOLINESS THE DALAI LAMA

## PERFECTION OF WISDOM "A GUIDE TO BODHISATTVA'S WAY OF LIFE"

skt.: Bodhisattvacharavatara; tib.: Byang chub sems dpai' spyod pa la jug pa

By Bodhisattva Shantideva Translated by Geshe Dorji Damdul

Advanced Level Course Material (Part 5 - Edition 1)



# PERFECTION OF WISDOM A GUIDE TO BODHISATTVA'S WAY OF LIFE

© Cover Photo - The Seventeen Nalanda Pandits Courtesy
Office of His Holiness the Dalai Lama (Edited by Tibet House
Publication Department)

#### All Rights Reserved

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owners.

A Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life - Perfection of Wisdom NMC Part 5 First Edition: September 2019

#### **Published by:**

Tibet House

Cultural Centre of His Holiness the Dalai Lama

1, Institutional Area, Lodhi Road,

New Delhi – 110003.

Website: www.tibethouse.in

Tel: +91 11 2461 1515 / 24603652

Mobile: +91-844-721-8959

 $Email: office@tibethouse.in \ , masterscourse@tibethouse.in \\$ 

#### NALANDA MASTERS COURSE IN BUDDHIST PHILOSOPHY

## PERFECTION OF WISDOM A GUIDE TO BODHISATTVA'S WAY OF LIFE

SKT.: BODHISATTVACHARAVATARA
TIB.: BYANG CHUB SEMS DPAI' SPYOD PA
LA JUG PA

By Bodhisattva Shantideva

Translated by Geshe Dorji Damdul



#### TIBET HOUSE

Cultural Centre of His Holiness the Dalai Lama
1, Institutional Area Lodhi Road, New Delhi – 110003

### **CONTENTS**

Preface	1
H.H. The Dalai Lama's Address	5
A Guide To The Bodhisattva's Way Of Life	17
Chapter Nine - Perfection Of Wisdom	17
The Need To Generate The Wisdom Realising Ultimate Reality	17
Ascertaining The Two Truths	17
Refuting Objections From The Proponents Of	
Inherent Existence	18
Refuting The Realists In General	18
(A) By Refuting Contradiction With Direct Perception	18
(B) By Refuting Contradiction With Buddha's Words	18
Refuting The Objections Of The Chittamatrins	
[Proponents Of Mind Only School]	20
Refuting The Assertion That The Path Which Understands	
Emptiness Is Of No Benefit	23
Establishing That The Wisdom Of Emptiness Is Ultimately	
The True Path To Liberation	24
Reasons That Establish The View Of Emptiness	27
(A) Establishing The "Selflessness Of Persons"	27
(1) Refutation Of The "Self" As Postulated By	
The Non-Buddhists Tenet Holders	28
A) Refutation Of Samkhya School's Position Of "Self"	28
B) Refutation Of Naiyayika School's Position Of "Self"	30
(2) Rejection Of Arguments Concerning	
"Selflessness Of Person"	30

(B) Selflessness Of Phenomena	32
(1) In Relation To Close Placement Of	
Mindfulness On The Body	32
(2) "Selflessness Of Phenomena" In Relation To	
Close Placement Of Mindfulness On Feeling	33
(3) "Selflessness Of Phenomena" In Relation To	
Close Placement Of Mindfulness On Mind	36
(4) "Selflessness Of Phenomena" In Relation To	
Close Placement Of Mindfulness Of Phenomena	36
Rejecting The Objection That The Two Truths Are Untenable	37
Logic That Establishes "Emptiness"	39
(A) Reasoning From The Viewpoint Of Cause	39
(1) Rejecting Causeless Production	39
(2) Rejecting Production From Permanent Causes	39
(3) Rejecting Production From	
"Permanent Primal Substance"	41
Summary	43
(B) Reasoning Of Dependent Origination To Establish	
The View Of "Selflessness"	44
(C) Reasoning To Establish "Emptiness" From	
The Viewpoint Of Effect	44
Sameness Of Samsara And Nirvana On The Ultimate Level	45
Advice On The Need To Strive To Realise Emptiness	45
(A) What Is The Reality?	45
(B) Drawbacks Of Samsara	46
The Mode Of Apprehension Of The Great Compassion	48
Respect For Sacred Books	49

#### **PREFACE**

As indicated in the Consumate Compendium of Dharma Sutra [tib: Choe-yang-dhagpar dhue pay dho,]

Enlightenment is not bestowed upon you by anyone, Nor is Enlightenment held by anyone [for you]; It is through realization of your own internal essence thoroughly, That [this essence of] Enlightenment [thus discovered] is labeled Enlightenment.

The potential for Enlightenment, also referred to as Buddha-nature, or Tathagatha Garba, exists within each one of us but it is to be discovered if we wish to be free from the pains and the fears of samsara. To arrive at this great City of Unification, various powerful methods, such as the practice of Mahamudra, the Union of Clarity and Emptiness, Dzogchen, and Innate Primordial Clear Light Mind, are employed by the great masters of Kagyu, Sakya, Nyingma and Gelug traditions respectively.

All of these methods were inherited from the compassionate Buddha Shakyamuni. In order to partake in the joy of seeing a beautiful painting, two essentials are necessary. The painting, as the object, must be very refined, and the eyes of the perceiver must be very fresh, as sharp and tender as that of a young child. Similarly, all of the above practices involve two facets - refining the subjective clear light mind to the subtlest level and refining the perception of the objective clear light [ultimate reality] - with which this most refined mind should eternally fuse, in order to fully pacify the turbulence of mind. This is how the naked nature of the awareness manifests for Enlightenment. This resonates so well with the meaning of the Heart Sutra mantra:

#### TADYATHÂ (OM) GATE GATE PÂRAGATE PÂRASAMGATE BODHI SVÂHÂ

Often, practitioners focus on only refining the subjective awareness and are oblivious to refining the perception of the objective clear light. Whereas others emphasize on kindling the experience of the objective clear light alone. Despite the preciousness of the practices, which they are assiduously

doing, it takes the seeker, as well as their devoted students, only half way along the path as it comprises only one of two conjoined parts. Even on the first part, i.e., following practices to refine the subjective clear light, which was taught by the Buddha in the third Turning of the Wheel of Dharma, awareness, meticulous observation and acuity, as well as great sensitivity and sharpness of mind, is required. Otherwise, as was well indicated by the great Sakya Pandita Kunga Gyaltsen, the attempts could potentially bring more damage than growth in the practitioner. It requires a great deal of expertise on the part of the teacher. The study of Buddhist psychology is of great benefit if one ventures into such practices. It is always advisable to delve into these practices with utmost care and much preparation, complimented by active accumulation of merits.

For the second part, which involves refining the perception of the objective clear light, one needs to have thorough insight into the Buddha's teachings in the second Turning of the Wheel of Dharma. This refers to the Perfection of Wisdom sutras, whose subject matter is the ultimate reality of all phenomena, and particularly in this context, the ultimate reality of the subjective clear light, which one has already manifested through any of the means mentioned above. Without this second element intact, one cannot possibly achieve Enlightenment at all, as indicated by Saint Saraha in the following verse:

By entering into emptiness but devoid of compassion,

One will not find the supreme path.

By meditating upon compassion alone [without the wisdom of emptiness],

One will not attain liberation, but remain in samsara.

Whosoever is capable of apprehending the unity of the two,

Will not remain in samsara nor abide in [personal] nirvana.

The reason for the Buddha Shakyamuni to remain silent for forty-nine days, immediately after attaining Enlightenment under the Bodhi tree, was to indicate the intricacies and the acute subtlety involved in the understanding of the objective clear light [ultimate reality].

As rightly indicated by Arya Nagarjuna and Acharya Chandrakirti, in their respective treatises, the safe haven to access the bare objective clear light is

to meticulously follow the studies of the tenet systems in a systematic way. The Buddha often praised in the Sutras, those who engage in any means such as reciting verses on emptiness, appreciating others doing so, let alone those who actually meditate, reflect and study the concept of emptiness, in order to proceed along the path. To realize the wisdom of emptiness is the only panacea to heal the pains of both oneself, as well as those of all sentient beings.

It is due to the immense blessings, great encouragement and far-reaching vision of His Holiness the Dalai Lama, who is deeply committed to reviving ancient Indian traditions and knowledge, and in particular, revitalizing the study of the profound Nalanda Buddhist Philosophy in the land of its birth, that this Masters course in Nalanda Studies was introduced by Tibet House, New Delhi, in December 2016. Most auspiciously, His Holiness graced the opening ceremony, and he is especially pleased to see the flourishing of the activities of Tibet House towards teaching the rich legacies of the erstwhile Nalanda adepts to students of many nationalities, directly in the English language, today.

Geshe Dorji Damdul Director Tibet House, New Delhi

## H.H. THE DALAI LAMA'S ADDRESS FOR THE LAUNCH OF NALANDA MASTERS COURSE

at Thyagraj Stadium, New Delhi on 9th December 2016

on the occasion of 51<sup>st</sup> anniversary of Tibet House, New Delhi



H.H. the Dalai Lama along with Shri Kiren Rijiju Ji, Union State Minister of Home Affairs and Shri Najeeb Jung Ji, Lt Governor of Delhi, launching the Nalanda Masters Course, an undertaking of Tibet House, Delhi.

D ear respected elder brothers and sisters and rest of brothers and sisters, I am extremely happy to come here, actually seeing a lot of young people, full of spirit and freshness and enthusiasm, I really appreciate it. If we want to change our world, we need young people full of enthusiasm, determination and will power. A lot of problems are there, if you look only at problems, then sometimes we feel demoralized, and like one cannot do anything, that kind of feeling. But from wider perspective, if you look logically, many problems that we are facing are actually our own creation, therefore logically, we have the ability to reduce these problems, and eliminate the man made problems. Therefore, we should keep our

enthusiasm, no matter how difficult it is, we must do something. So I very much appreciate the audience today, I think it's wonderful to see so many young people. Maybe in some corner, maybe some are sleeping [laughing], otherwise all are fully present and alert, which is wonderful. Then I want to thank Tibet house and Men Tsee Khang for organizing this programme, I very much appreciate it.

The Men Tsee Khang, Sowa Rigpa, is taking care of our body. The old medical system, it is actually about taking care of our body. Tibetan medical system is more holistic, including addressing some mental disturbances, for depression or too much stress. So, Men Tsee Khang is mainly about taking care of our body. On the other hand, the Tibet House programme is actually about taking care of our mind and inner peace. That is something very important. I believe this according to my own life experience. When I was young, I was a very lazy student, not much interested in studying. Then, at around 13-14 years of age, I developed some interest, and carried out more serious studies. Finally, a tragic situation developed and in 1959 March, there is no other choice; there is real danger, even to my life. So, we escaped and then reached India.

In the early part of our refugee life, our main effort, main concern, was the preservation of our tradition and knowledge. The proper way to preserve this knowledge combined with modern education, therefore we asked Pundit Nehru to please create a Tibetan school, a school especially for Tibetans so we have the opportunity to study Tibetan and retain certain Tibetan knowledge. Meantime, a few thousand Tibetan monks, students and scholars are there are, so we asked the Indian government to please make some special arrangements for these young monks and teachers. The Government of India graciously arranged it, so we attempted to give our younger generation in exile a modern education and at the same time, try to preserve our own tradition knowledge.

Then in 1973, I had the opportunity to visit different European countries, then in 1979, Soviet Union and Mongolia, too, at that time a Communist country. In the same year, I visited America. After that, I started speaking of a sense of global responsibility. We are all a part of a common world. We are all partaking of the fresh air of this blue planet. We are all human beings. So a lot of problems happen because there is too much emphasis on

differences: on different nationality, different race, the poor and rich, educated and uneducated and also different religions, all these is our own creations. We need a sense of global responsibility. So then gradually, I felt that the culture heritage and knowledge that we kept over thousands of years, and also amongst the Tibetan refugee community, maybe it is time to share it with other people.

With this view, for more than thirty years now, I developed and engaged in serious discussions with modern scientists. I found there are some similarities. It becomes very clear that there is mutual benefit and learning in this dialogue. I usually describe Buddha Shakyamuni as having different aspects, one aspect of Buddha Shakyamuni is as the founder of Buddhism, and another aspect of Buddha is that of a great philosopher and great thinker. The majority of traditions have three aspects, I usually say. The first aspect is religion. Religion means compassion, affection, forgiveness, tolerance, containment, self-discipline - these are the essence of all major traditions. Over 2000 - 3000 years, these different religious traditions still remain a source of inspiration to millions of people. Then another aspect of these different religious traditions is philosophy. In the philosophical field, there are differences between religions. Many major world religions believe in a Creator. On the other hand, a part of Samkhya philosophy and Jain philosophy, as well as Buddhist philosophy, believe in the law of causality and karma, and on the basis of the continuation of mind, which has no beginning, there is no Creator. Within non -theistic religions, too, there are differences and even within Buddhism, as far as philosophically different viewpoints are concerned, there are four major schools of thought: Vaibhashika, Sautantrika, Chittamatrin, and Madhyamaka, as well as various sub-schools.

Now, in the philosophical field, there are differences between religions, but then we have to ask ourselves, what is the purpose of these different philosophies? They all have the same purpose. To strengthen the practice of love. For example, for those who believe in the concept of a Creator, God is infinite love, we are all created by such a God, which is a very powerful approach to strengthening one's practice of love and forgiveness. For non-theistic religions, the belief in causality brings the whole responsibility on one's own shoulder, so that also is another very effective approach. For different people, with many different mental dispositions, different philosophical approaches are required to increase confidence about these inner values. For this reason, that even followers of the same teacher, Buddha, have many differing dispositions, he was compelled to teach different philosophical views.

Then the third aspect is tradition or cultural heritage, that frankly speaking, accord with a way of life that is very much influenced by the existing society system, say a feudal system. Therefore, that part needs to change according to times and circumstances, we have to modify it. To summarize, the first aspect of religion, there is no need to change, we must carry on with the original practice. Second, the philosophy also, according to different mental dispositions, you have to study all different philosophies, check according to your own mental disposition and when you find a philosophical position that is most suitable for you, then you take on that philosophy. The cultural aspect, as I mentioned, needs to be updated from time to time. For example, in the Tibetan tradition, generally, the Dalai Lama institution is considered something very important. As early as in 1969, in one of my formal statements, I stated that whether this very institution of the Dalai Lama should continue or not is up to Tibetan people. Then in 2011, I completely retired from temporal responsibility. The cultural tradition of the last four centuries, that the Dalai Lama institution automatically holds both temporal and spiritual authority, that -formally, officially, proudly, happily and voluntarily - ceased with this move, because the situation changed. I think now today, whether in the political field, or the religious field, I think authoritarianism is out of date.

A third aspect of Buddha Shakyamuni, a unique attribute, is I consider Buddha Shakyamuni as an ancient Indian scientist as well. The reason? In one of his teachings, he mentioned that all his followers, monks and scholars, should not accept his teachings out of faith or devotion, but rather, after thorough investigation and experimentation. This is very much a scientific way of thinking, a scientific approach in order to seek truth or reality. These days I describe myself as half Buddhist monk, half scientist [laughing]. My late great friend, the scientist Francisco Varela, when we were discussing science, certain different topics, then he used to say, now I am wearing my scientific hat, then at times he would say now I am wearing Buddhist hat, while explaining Buddhist thinking or some Buddhist

concept. Since the late Varela is very close in my mind, I also try to be a follower of him, wearing a Buddhist hat, and a science hat, at various times.

In today's world, I think despite a lot of material progress and development and highly advanced scientific research, many-many such achievements, still there is a lot of killing, a lot of suffering, and a huge gap between the rich and poor. Not only at a global level, between the southern world and northern world, but also within the same nation, there are huge gaps between the rich and poor. In the last few days, BBC mentioned in Nigeria, thousands of children are dying due to starvation and showed pictures. It is very sad, the same planet, the same human being, some are living very very luxurious lifestyles and wasting a lot of resources, others, particularly children, are undergoing immense suffering. All this is due to our negligence, we just think of ourselves, and lack a sense of oneness and humanity. If we really develop sense of sameness, oneness of humanity, then how can you remain indifferent, seeing innocent children dying due to starvation?

The killing of a human being by an animal, by an elephant or tiger, now becomes a news item. But human beings killing other human beings, this has almost become normal now. Terrible! I think it is absolutely wrong. The same planet, same human beings, same species, some are dying due to human activities and behavior, and we remain indifferent, I think is totally wrong. As a Buddhist practitioner, in our daily practice, we describe the entire sentient beings having been one's mother and as dear as to one as one's own mother. If you seriously say these prayers, then you have to mean it. At the practical level, we have no connection with other galaxies, only with this planet. Even within this planet, the limitless different forms of life, different species, mammals, birds, like that, we cannot communicate with these sentient beings. At the beginning of this year, I was in Mayo Clinic, and where I was put up, there were some deer. When I saw these deer, I thought, they are also the same sentient being like human beings, they too want happiness and do not want suffering. These animals do not have human intelligence and no language to communicate, so I cannot do anything for them.

But for seven billion human beings, we have this human brain, human language – okay, different language but still we can communicate with each other. So then, we have to think, if I really pray for entire sentient beings, then I must do something at least for other human beings. There are 7 billion human beings on this same planet! The joyfulness and happiness that comes from material development and a materialistic life, is very much dependent on some sort of sensorial experiences - beautiful articles, beautiful music, tasteful food, smell, and touch, including sex. These are sensorial level experiences and with wealth, obviously sensorial level, everything is okay. But at a mental level, too much sadness, too much stress, too much fear, then sensorial level pleasure is not of much help. We can check for ourselves. If one is mentally peaceful and happy, then we can subdue sensorial level pains. But if there is pain at the mental level, it cannot be subdued by physical level, sensorial level, pleasures. Therefore, obviously, mental level experiences are more important than sensorial level experiences. Now as materialistic life is entirely based on sensorial level experiences, this is not going to be adequate.

As a human being, the real destroyer of our inner peace is negative emotions, such as anger, hatred, and fear. There are not sensorial level, but mental level pains. So the method, the right approach, in order to reduce these pains is not to rely on sensorial level experiences, induced by alcohol, drugs, tranquilizers, because these bring limited calmness at the physical level but since these problems have developed at the mental level, so the counter force must also be developed at the mental level. Hence training of mind is so very important. Now in the west, more and more people are really showing an interest in learning about about meditation or mindfulness. Again, meditation - usually considered as single pointedness of the mind or shamatha- that is also a sort of temporary tranquilizer. The real antidote to destructive emotions is analytical meditation, what we call vipasana¹. Vipasana is most appropriate way to tackle destructive emotions.

In order to do make sufficient progress on tackling negative emotions, first we should have sufficient knowledge about the system of the emotions and the system of mind. Usually I call it the map of emotion: from where they start, what are their causes and conditions, what's their effect, and what are the interrelations with other emotions. Once we are fully aware of these

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>It is to be noted that Vipasana in the Mahayana Buddhist tradition is not to be confused with the Vipasana as taught by Shri Goenka ji's excellent meditation centres, which is very strong in its own tradition.

things, then it is much easier to tackle these destructive emotions. In the past, you see, these things remained as a part of religious practice. Now the time has come, as I mentioned earlier, to share such knowledge with other people, so it should not be considered as the practice of religion and the practice of Buddhism, no, rather simply as an academic subject. I usually describe just as we have hygiene of the physical, similarly we need hygiene of the mental / emotional. In order to carry out the hygiene of the physical, we need knowledge about the body. Similarly, for hygiene of emotions, we need knowledge about the whole system of emotion.

This knowledge must be considered as an academic subject for the well being of this very life, day to day life. We are not talking about next life, not talking about nirvana, simply trying to create a stable happy mind, peaceful mind, and through that, a healthy body. Now scientists also agree that a healthy mind is a key factor for a healthy body. Constant fear, constant anger, actually eats our immune system. Furthermore, nowadays, some scientists are investigating what is basic human nature by carrying on careful observation and examination on very, very young infants, 5-6 months old with language not yet developed, by showing them different pictures and recording their reaction. They concluded that basic human nature is compassionate, so this is a really hopeful sign! If basic human nature is anger, then no hope! Then better to pray to God, take to heaven or send to hell and this world become empty, sooner the better [laughing]. But if basic human nature is compassionate, there is real hope.

Now, we come to the importance of education. The existing education system is very much oriented to material values. Whole generations, who come from that kind of education, their whole way of life is materialistic life, materialistic culture. In India, in the past, all holistic and rich knowledge was developed and exported to China, to Tibet, Burma, Sri Lanka, Thailand, all these countries. Nowadays, in the place of their origin, India, no one is paying much attention to this knowledge! So now the time has come, for you Indians to once again pay more attention about your traditional knowledge about the inner world [and not necessarily by becoming Buddhist or religious-minded]. If you're a non-believer, fine, remain a non-believer but with fuller knowledge about inner mental systems, then you are able to tackle your own inner disturbances.

Certain knowledge which we Tibetans got from India and kept for a thousand years, now I am convinced the time has come to share these with the rest of humanity. Kangyur and Tengyur, the translation of Buddha's own word and translation of Nalanda masters teaching, together comprise more than 300 volumes. According to their content, since 10-15 years, we came to the conclusion they maybe usefully divided into three parts: one part science, one part philosophy, one part religion. The religious part maybe of concern only for Buddhists, but the science part, particularly the science of mind part, is something very useful for all 7 billion human beings. Of the philosophy part, there are two categories, one directly related to Buddhism and Buddha dharma, another philosophy is a general sort of concept common to all.

For example, like the concept of two truths is very much related to quantum physics. We understand it to mean that there is a difference between appearances and ultimate reality, so we usually call it two truths [in Sanskrit, they are called Samvritisatya and Parmasatya]. One of my Indian friends, his nickname is "India's Sakharov" a physicist, nuclear physicist, now he is no longer alive. Once in Delhi, here, in one of our meetings, he told me quantum physics in the west is a new concept, a new idea, but in this country, two thousand years ago, already that concept had been developed! In some of Nagajurna's writing, he found that concept that nothing exists objectively! So that kind of philosophy, I think is common and applicable to everybody in order to know their reality.

It is also very helpful because a lot of our destructive emotions are very much based on appearances, so the counter measure is try to think of the deeper level of reality, then there is no proper basis of anger and attachment. Here also, my friend, one American scientist, Aaron Beck - very old, much older than me, when I first met him, his age was 84, now my last meeting, his age was 96 or 97 - so he told me that over 3-4 decades, he treated people who were mentally much disturbed, mainly by anger. Eventually, his conclusion is, when we develop anger, 90% of that negativity is mental projection. The object with which the person feels angry appears very negative, everybody has the same experience, including myself, that when we develop anger, the object seems very negative, want to hit, something like that! But he mentioned, actually 90% of that negativity is our own mental projection.

That is exactly what Nagarjuna has stated! Therefore, some of this Buddhist philosophical thinking is quite useful, irrespective of whether one is a Buddhist or non-Buddhist, whether believer or non-believer. Now, after decades of my own experience, I have gained some personal confidence that I think certain ideas and concepts which we kept over a thousand years in Tibet, are very effective and useful. These ideas were mainly introduced by Shantarakshita, a great scholar of Nalanda, a great Madhyamaka philosopher and a great logician. In spite of his old age, he accepted an invitation from the Tibetan emperor in the 8th century, to go there. Nowadays I think, when Shantarakshita entered Tibet, a famous thinker and respected master from India, on Tibetan horse or yak, then eating Tibetan Tsampa, he must have initially found it very difficult but I think in time, he was satisfied with Tibetan devotion, Tibetan friendly attitude, so he decided to stay there for the remainder of his life [laughing].

Since our real teacher in the 8th century, the Nalanda master Shantarakshita, was himself a great logician and philosopher, as his followers, we Tibetans still carry the Nalanda tradition in us. So, I often describe, you Indians historically were our guru, our teacher, we are Indian's chela, now fortunately or unfortunately, chela has become more knowledgeable than the guru [laughing]. Anyways, this knowledge is your knowledge, your treasure, now that the world is facing some sort of major crises about emotions, at such a period, I think ancient Indian knowledge is not only to be ascribed to ancient times but is to be seen as very relevant to today's world. Therefore, it is very important to revive ancient Indian knowledge.

I am very, very happy, more and more young Indians are now really showing an interest, not only an interest but a serious desire for study about these ancient Indian, great thinkers and their views. It is really encouraging! Because of that circumstance, Tibet house and [Ven. Geshe Dorji] Damdul la, now he is very actively carrying out this work, so wonderful! Mainly because there are people who are really eager to learn more, so then the teacher also becomes useful and active. This is interdependency - for a good listener, then talk is relevant, if there is no listener, then no use to talk. Therefore, I think recent years, our activities have now become more widespread because there is a greater audience there, so I very much appreciate it, thank you. As I mentioned briefly, these 17 Nalanda masters, these I usually describe as professors of Nalanda University. Not just

#### 14 | Nalanda Masters Course - Part 5 - Edition 1

carrying out some rituals, no! Rather, based on profound philosophy and detailed explanations about our mind, about our emotions, so their teachings are really very relevant at an academic and practical level.



H.H. the Dalai Lama with some of the participants of the first batch of the Nalanda Masters Course

Therefore, I never state Buddhism is the best religion, I never state. Like medicine, according to one's illness, according to the patient, we can say this medicine or that medicine is best. In general, we cannot say this medicine is best. Similarly, according to different people, with different mental dispositions, we can say this spiritual tradition is best for him or for her. Generally, we cannot say, any religion, this or that religion, is best. So I never try to propagate Buddhism - in the west, Judo-Christian countries, it is better for them to keep their own traditional faith., where as India, the land of Buddha dharma, land of Buddha, all these Nalanda masters, as I mentioned earlier, all are Indian and mainly South Indian. I think almost none are northern Indian, all these masters come form South India. So, sometimes, I jokingly tell, south Indian brain is something very special. Thank you!! Thank you very much!!



# A GUIDE TO THE BODHISATTVA'S WAY OF LIFE PERFECTION OF WISDOM

#### A GUIDE TO THE BODHISATTVA'S WAY OF LIFE

By Bodhisattva Shantideva (8<sup>th</sup> Cent. C.E.)

#### **Chapter Nine - PERFECTION OF WISDOM**

#### THE NEED TO GENERATE THE WISDOM REALISING ULTIMATE REALITY

The Sage propounded all these branches [of teachings]
 For the sake of [promoting] wisdom.
 Therefore, those who wish to pacify suffering Should generate wisdom.

#### ASCERTAINING THE TWO TRUTHS

- (2) Conventional and Ultimate,These are accepted as being the two truths.The Ultimate is not the object of [dualistic] mind;The [dualistic] mind is spoken of [in relation to] the Conventional [truth].
- (3) In light of that, the world is seen to be of two types: Yogis and common people.And regarding that, the world of common people Is undermined by the world of the yogis.
- (4) Through differences in their intelligence, [the views of] Yogis too are undermined by progressively higher ones By means of examples accepted by both, and because Unanalysed [both engage in practices] for the sake of the result.

## REFUTING OBJECTIONS FROM THE PROPONENTS OF INHERENT EXISTENCE

#### REFUTING THE REALISTS IN GENERAL

#### (A) By Refuting Contradiction with Direct Perception

(6) But even form and so on [which are perceived by] direct perception

Are but a convention that is not [perceived] by valid cognition [which views the ultimate];

[Form and so on] are false, like worldly acceptance of that What is unclean and so forth as clean and so forth.

#### (B) BY REFUTING CONTRADICTION WITH BUDDHA'S WORDS

(7) For the sake of letting the [common] world enter [into reality],

The Guardian [Buddha] taught [about truly existent] functional things.

In the ultimate sense, however, they are not "momentary." [Suppose, like the Sautrantikas (known as *Followers of Sutra*)] you object,

"But that is also contradictory on the conventional [level]."

(8) The [valid] convention of Yogis [has] no fault [of contradiction].

Otherwise, [their] assertion of the uncleanliness Of a woman's [body, for instance] Would be undermined by the [common] world.

(9) [Furthermore] from the illusion-like Victorious Ones,

[arise] positive force,

In the same way as if they [actually] were [truly existent] functional things.

Suppose you object, "But, if a sentient being were like an illusion,

Then how could he take rebirth, once having died?"

- (10) [Well] so long as conditions are gathered together, The illusion lasts that long as well. And how could a sentient being be truly existent Merely because his continuum lasts longer?
- (11)In murdering, an illusory person and so on, There is no negative force, since it has no mind. But with someone having an illusion[-like] mind, Positive and negative forces accrue.
- (12) Because mantras and so forth lack the ability, [They] cannot produce a mind in an illusion. Even illusory ones that arise from varying conditions are of varying kinds, [Since] nowhere is there one condition with the ability to [produce] all [things].
- (13) [Suppose you ask] "If ultimately someone is released in [natural] nirvana And conventionally is circling in samsara; Then Buddha as well would be circling in samsara, and What use would there be for bodhisattya conduct?"
- (14) [Well] even an illusion cannot be turned back Unless the continuity of its [causal] conditions has ceased. Yet, when the continuity of those conditions ceases, It does not arise even on the conventional [level].

## REFUTING THE OBJECTIONS OF THE CHITTAMATRINS [PROPONENTS OF MIND ONLY SCHOOL]

(15) [Suppose, like the Chittamatrin (Mind Only School) you then ask]

"When even the deceptive awareness [of it] doesn't [truly] exist,

By what is the illusion apprehended?"

[Well] since according to you, the illusion itself does not [externally] exist,

Then what is being apprehended?

(16) [Suppose you answer],

"In actuality, it exists as something else:

The aspect of which is the very mind itself."

[Well] when mind itself is like an illusion,

Then what is being seen by what?

(17) The Guardian of the World, in fact, said

"Mind cannot see mind."

Just as the edge of a sword cannot cut itself,

So [it is with] the mind.

(18) [Suppose you respond]

"But, it is just like the way a candle flame

Perfectly illuminates its own characteristics."

[Well] the flame of a candle is not being illuminated [by itself],

Since darkness does not obscure [darkness].

(19) [Suppose you reply],

"There is blue in a crystal [resting on blue] and an intrinsic blue [as in lapis lazuli]

Which does not depend on something else [for its colour].

So like this, [we] see some [things] that depend on something else

And some that do not."

- (20) The intrinsic blue is not [tenable],There isn't anything that makes itself blue;
- (21) If [you] say that "the mind cognizes
   The illumination of the candle flame,"
   [Well] based upon whose cognition can the statement be made,
- (22) Since it has never been seen by anyone,
  Discussing whether it is [self]-luminous

"A mind has an illuminating nature"?

Or not, is meaningless;

Like the attractiveness of a barren woman's daughter.

(23) [Suppose you insist]

"But if a self-cognizing mind does not exist,
Then how can a consciousness be recalled?"
[Well] a recollection comes about from a connection
With another [object] that was experienced, like [recalling]
the poison from a rat [bite].

(24) [And suppose you persist]

"But it can illuminate itself because,

When endowed with other conditions, [one can] see [others' minds]."

[Well] by means of applying magic eye lotion,

A [buried treasure] vase is seen while the eye lotion itself [is not seen].

(25) Those which are seen, heard, or known

Are not to be negated.

Here, [instead] the conception of true existence, which is the cause of suffering,

- 22 | Nalanda Masters Course Part 5 Edition 1

  Is to be rejected.
- (26) [Suppose you say]"The illusion [of an external object] is not separate from the mind;

Despite being inseparable, it is still impermanent."

[Well] if it were a [truly existent] functional thing, how could it not be different [from the mind]?

And if [you say] it is not different, it could not be a [truly existent] functional thing.

(27) Although the illusion is not truly existent, it is still an object of view,

So it is for the viewer.

Suppose [you still object] "But samsara must have [some truly existent] functional thing as its support;

Otherwise, it would be like space."

(28) [Well] how could a non-thing, supported by a truly existent thing,

Come to have a function [of giving rise to bondage and liberation]?

The mind you [asserted] would be [reduced, in fact] To something existing alone by itself, accompanied by nothing.

(29) And if the mind is free of [an object of] apprehension,Then everyone would be a One Thus Gone [Buddha].And if that were the case, what benefit would there be In conceiving of mind-only?

#### REFUTING THE ASSERTION THAT THE PATH WHICH UNDERSTANDS EMPTINESS IS OF NO BENEFIT

(30) [Suppose you ask]

"Even upon knowing the illusion-like [nature of things], How do disturbing emotions subside? Since lust for an illusory woman Can arise even in the one who conjured her up?"

(31) [Well, that happens because] heretofore the conjurer has not rid himself

Of dispositions of disturbing emotions towards knowable things,

And so when he sees her,

His inclination towards emptiness is still weak.

(32) However, by habituating himself with the imprint of understanding emptiness,

He will rid himself of the inclination to see things [as truly existent].

Then, by habituating himself with the "emptiness" of all [phenomena including even emptiness],

Later, he will be rid of even the idea [of the true existence of emptiness].

- (33) Through not finding the object of investigation, The non-existence of that thing is claimed. Then lacking a basis, How can the emptiness of a thing stand in front of the mind?
- (34) When neither a [truly existent] functional thing, Nor the emptiness of the functional thing stands before the mind,

[Then] having no other [object of] apprehension, There is full pacification in [a state] without mental apprehension.

#### 24 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE - PART 5 - EDITION 1

- (35) [Then] just as a wish-fulfilling gem
  And a wish-granting tree fulfill all wishes;
  Likewise, through the power of prayers,
  The enlightened body of a Victor appears to the disciples.
- (36) For example, when a *garudika* healer,Who empowered a healing cairn, has passed away,[That cairn] can pacify poison and the likeLong after [the healer's] death.
- (37) Similarly, when a bodhisattva has passed into nirvana, After setting up the reliquary [body] of a Victor In accord with bodhisattva's conduct, He still performs all [the necessary] deeds.
- (38) [Suppose you ask]
  "How can offerings made to something lacking a mind give rise to results?"
  [Well] because whether he is alive
  Or has already passed into nirvana,
  [Making offerings] has been proclaimed [to generate] the same [amount of merit].
- (39) According to scriptural authority, results [accrue] Whether on the conventional or ultimate level Similar to the way [you say that offerings made] To a truly existent Buddha give results.

## ESTABLISHING THAT THE WISDOM OF EMPTINESS IS ULTIMATELY THE TRUE PATH TO LIBERATION

(40) [Suppose, like the Hinayanist tenet holders, you then object]

"But, since liberation occurs through seeing the [four noble] truths,

What is the use of seeing Emptiness?"

[Well] why? Because in scriptures it is proclaimed That without this path, there is no Enlightenment.

#### Suppose [you then object] (41)

"But, Mahayana is not established [as valid]!" [Well] how can [your] scriptures be established? [If you answer] "Because they are established for both parties."

[Well, you should accept that] they were not established for you from the start.

(42) Any criterion that would give confidence in them Would equally [apply] to the Mahayana [scriptures] too. And if acceptance by two different parties could make something true,

Then the Vedas and so on also would become true.

#### (43) Suppose [you argue],

"But it is because the Mahayana [scriptures that] are disputed."

[Well] because [your] scriptures are disputed by non-Buddhists

And some other [sections within your] scriptures [are disputed] by yourselves and others,

They would have to be discarded [too].

(44) Although, the [Arhat] Bhikshus are the foundation of the [Buddha's] teachings,

> It is hard [for you to posit the existence] of [Arhat] Bhikshus [Because] it is difficult for those endowed with minds apprehending

True existence to posit the feasibility of Nirvana.

#### (45) [Suppose you reply]

samsaric birth].

"But they are liberated, because they rid themselves of disturbing emotions."

[Well] that [liberation] must occur immediately upon [overcoming just the manifest afflictions];

However, despite [their] lacking [gross] disturbing emotions,

They have the karmic potential [to propel them to another

- (46) Suppose [you then say],
  "But it is definite that they do not have
  Craving [as a condition] for obtaining [rebirth]."
  Even if this craving is not [entirely a gross] disturbing emotion
  Why does it not exist [on two levels, grosser and subtler] like the ignorance does.
- (47) Through the force of feeling, there is craving,And feeling exists in those [purported Arhats] as well.So a mind having [true existence] as its objectIs what some [people] are endowed with.
- (48) A mind that is parted from [the experience of] emptiness.
   May block [disturbing emotion], but they will arise once again,
   Like [conceptual discriminations arising after] the meditative equipoise of non-discrimination
   Therefore, [one needs to] meditate on emptiness.
- (49) [So again] if you accept as spoken by the Buddha Any speech that has been included in the sutras, Then why not accept the Mahayana [sutras] which, for the most part, Are equivalent to [your] sutras?
- (50) If because of one exception,

All would become corrupt;
Then why, because of one equivalence to [your] sutras,
Would not all have been spoken by the Buddha?

- (51) And who would consider unacceptableSome speech, the depths of which[Even] Maha-Kasyapa and the like could not fathom,[Simply] because you cannot understand it?
- (52) [After all] the fruit of [realizing] emptiness is this:Through freedom from the extremes of attachment and fear,One is able to remain in samsaraFor the sake of those who suffer due to ignorance,
- (53) As this is the case, disputation Against emptiness is improper. Therefore, without indecision, Please meditate on emptiness.
- (54) Emptiness is the remedy to the darknessOf afflictive and cognitive obscurations;[So] how can someone wishing to achieve omniscience quicklyNot meditate on it?
- (55) Since [grasping at the true existence of] things gives rise to the sufferingWhich we fear,While [realizing] emptiness pacifies that suffering,Why be fearful about that [wisdom realizing emptiness]?

#### REASONS THAT ESTABLISH THE VIEW OF EMPTINESS

- (A) ESTABLISHING THE "SELFLESSNESS OF PERSONS"
- (56) If there were something called a "self",

#### 28 | Nalanda Masters Course - Part 5 - Edition 1

There would be something to be afraid. But as one finds "self" nowhere, Who is there to experience fear?

(57) Teeth, hair, and nails are not a "self".Nor is "self" the bones or blood.["Self" is] neither mucous nor phlegm.Nor is "self" lymph or pus.

(58) "Self" is not fat nor sweat.Neither is "self" the lungs nor liver."Self" is not any of the other visceral organs.Neither is "self" faeces nor urine.

(59) Flesh and skin are not a "self";Nor is "self" heat or wind.In no way is "self" one of the bodily orifices,Nor are [any of] the six types of consciousness a "self."

## (1) REFUTATION OF THE "SELF" AS POSTULATED BY THE NON-BUDDHISTS TENET HOLDERS

#### A) REFUTATION OF SAMKHYA SCHOOL'S POSITION OF "SELF"

(60) And if the mind [perceiving] sound were permanent
[as Samkhyas assert],
The sound would be cognized at all times.
But what is cognised when bereft of an object to be cognised?
By what means could it be called a cognizer?

(61) If [something] could be a cognizer without an object of cognition,Then absurdly a stick would also be a cognizer.Therefore, without being associated with an object of

Therefore, without being associated with an object of cognition,

It is certain that cognition is non-existent.

(62) Suppose [you say],

"It cognizes a 'sight'."

[Well] why doesn't it also hear at that time?

If [you answer], "Because the sound is not nearby,"

[Well] then it is no longer a cognizer of it.

(63) How can something having the nature of being a cognizer of sound

Become the cognizer of sight?

[By virtue of] imputation a single person is a 'father' and a 'son'

And not [due to] his 'absolute nature.'

(64) Likewise [the state of equilibrium of] courage [sattva, pleasure], particles [rajas, pain], and darkness [tamas, neutral sensation [as the absolute nature],

Is neither a 'son' nor a 'father';

And [a cognizer of a sight] has never been seen

That has a fundamental nature connected with a cognizer of a sound.

(65) [Suppose you persist]

"Like a dancer, it is still itself, but is seen in another guise."

[Well then] it would be impermanent.

And suppose [you clarify], the other guise is the very same [entity],

[Well then] its oneness [in fundamental nature] is a oneness that did not exist before.

(66) Suppose [you explain],

"But its other modes [of perception] are not true."

Then please describe its own [innate] nature.

Suppose [you answer], "It is a cognizer."

[Well then], absurdly it would follow that all persons are one.

- 30 | Nalanda Masters Course Part 5 Edition 1
- (67) [Further] what has mind and what lacks mind those two would, in fact, become the same thing Because their existence would be the same. And if their individual identities were false, Then what could be their shared basis?

#### B) REFUTATION OF NAIYAYIKA SCHOOL'S POSITION OF "SELF"

- (68) Furthermore, something lacking mind cannot be a self [as Nyaya-Vaisheshikas assert], Because it has no mind, like a vase and such things. Now [suppose you claim], "It is cognizant because of its conjunction with a mind." Then it absurdly follows that [this] non-cognizant [self] has perished.
- (69) And if the self were [in fact] unchanging,What could a mind do to it?If [the self] were devoid of mind and activities,Space could also become a self.

# (2) REJECTION OF ARGUMENTS CONCERNING "SELFLESSNESS OF PERSON"

- (70) Suppose you [then] object,"But, if a [permanent] self does not truly exist,The connection between actions and their effects could not be maintained.Since, actions cease after having been done,To whom should the action be ascribed?"
- (71) [Well] since it is established for both of us That action and result have a different basis, And that the self has no active role in this, Is it not useless to debate on this [point]?

(72) Seeing a causal state endowed [with a simultaneous] result Is never feasible.

Through the shared continuum, The agent and the experiencer [of results] are explained.

- (73) The past and the future minds Are not the self, since they do not exist [presently]. And, if the mind [presently] arising were the self, When it perishes, there would, in fact, be no self!
- (74) For example, when the trunk of a plantain tree Is split apart, nothing [is found]. Likewise, when sought through investigation, A self also cannot be [found as] an absolute thing.
- (75) [Suppose] you ask, "If sentient beings do not exist, Towards whom could one generate compassion?" [Well, the objects of compassion are] those [beings], accepted [as existing, for whom we cultivate the desire to achieve] the resultant state [of enlightenment] And who are imputed by ignorance.
- (76) [Suppose you then ask] "Who owns the fruit, if there are no sentient beings?" [Well] fair enough. But this is accepted [on the level of imputation] by ignorance [For the sake of] the result, in order to completely pacify suffering, do not abandon [those aspects of the path which have an element of ignorance.

### (B) SELFLESSNESS OF PHENOMENA

# (1) IN RELATION TO CLOSE PLACEMENT OF MINDFULNESS ON THE BODY

- (77) Because of the misperception of the self, the arrogance, which is a source of suffering, increases.[Suppose] you say, "But, that cannot be undermined."[Well, then] it is best to meditate on selflessness.
- (78) A body is neither the feet nor the calves.Nor is a body, the thighs or the hips.Neither the belly nor the back is the body.Nor is a body the chest or the arms.
- (79) The sides of the torso and the hands are not a body.Nor is a body the armpits or the shoulders.The visceral organs also are not it.And neither is a body the head nor the neck.So what then is a body?
- (8o) If this body were locatedWith a portion in all of these [parts];Then, although the parts are located in [its own] parts,Where are [the parts] in turn located?
- (81) And if a body itself, in its entirety, Were located [everywhere], in the hands and so forth, There would be as many bodies As there were hands and so on.
- (82) As the body does not exist [either] outside or inside [the parts],How could the hands and so forth possess a body?As it does not exist separately from the hands and so on,How could it possibly be [truly] existent?

(83) Thus, a body is not [truly] existent.

But because of ignorance,

The mind perceiving a self in hands, and so forth, arises.

Like the mind perceiving a man in an effigy,

Because the [effigy] is moulded in the shape [of a man].

(84) For as long as the conditions are assembled, The figure [of effigy] is seen as a man. Likewise, for as long as there are hands and so on, They are seen as the body.

(85) Similarly, because of its being a composite of fingers, Where is the hand? [The same analysis can be applied to] that [finger], because of its being a composite of joints;

And to a joint as well, with the breakdown into its own parts;

(86) And to a part, as well, through breaking it down into particles; And to that particle as well, because of directional divisions; And to the directional parts also, because of lacking [intrinsic] parts, Like space, the particles do not [truly] exist.

(87) Therefore, what wise [person] would be attached To a bodily form that is like a dream? And since a body does not [truly] exist that way, Then what is a male and what is a female?

## (2) "SELFLESSNESS OF PHENOMENA" IN RELATION TO CLOSE PLACEMENT OF MINDFULNESS ON FEELING

(88) If suffering was absolute by nature, Why does it not undermine [our experience of] extreme joy? And if happiness [existed intrinsically], Why does a good taste and so forth not delight someone

- 34 | Nalanda Masters Course Part 5 Edition 1 tormented by grief and the like.
- (89) Suppose [you answer],"It is not experienced, because it is overriddenBy something more intense."[Well] how can something not in the nature of an experienceStill be [categorized as] a feeling?
- (90) Suppose [you reply]
  "Could it not still be suffering in a subtle state,
  After its gross [level] has been displaced?"
  [Well, then] you could [also] say that, other than that
  [extreme joy], it was a slight [level of] joy,
  And then, [absurdly] its subtle state would be one of that [joy] too.
- (91) Suppose [you say],"But with the arising of discordant conditions,There is no arising of suffering."[Well] is it not established thatA feeling is [merely] something imputed by a conceptual thought?
- (92) Because of that, [one] should
   Meditate on this analytical remedy.
   The concentrative mind that grows from the field of examination
   Is the food of yogis.
- (93) If there is a gap between a sense power and its object, Where would they meet?And if there is no gap, they would be fused as one, So the meeting would be of what with what?
- (94) Yet, there cannot be penetration of a particle by a particle:

They have no empty space and they are of uniform [size]. When there is no penetration, there is no co-mingling; And when there is no co-mingling, there is no meeting.

- (95) Moreover, for something that is partless, How could what might be called "a meeting" properly take place? If a meeting and being partless can be observed [together], Then show it, please!
- (96) For a consciousness, which is immaterial, A meeting is untenable; A collection as well does not truly exist. The analysis [of the collection of words] undertaken previously is also applicable here.
- (97) And so, like that, when contact does not truly exist, From what does a feeling arise? For what reason, [then] is all this painful effort made? For whom and from what can harm occur?
- (98) And when no [truly existent] one feels, And feeling, as well, does not [truly] exist, Then seeing this situation, Why is craving not eliminated?
- (99) Nevertheless, [some things] can be seen and also can be touched Through what has the nature of a dream or an illusion. [Furthermore] a feeling, because it has arisen simultaneously with the mind. Is not perceived by that [mind].
- (100) [Those] produced before or after [the feeling] Can remember and not experience [that feeling].

# 36 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE — PART 5 — EDITION 1 [In short, a feeling] cannot experience itself,

And it cannot be experienced by something else either.

(101) As there is no [truly existent] one that feels,Then feeling cannot truly exist.How can it induce harmTo this collection [of aggregates] that lacks a true self?

# (3) "SELFLESSNESS OF PHENOMENA" IN RELATION TO CLOSE PLACEMENT OF MINDFULNESS ON MIND

(102) A mind does not exist in sense powers, in forms and so on,Nor in the space in between.A mind is not inside, nor outside,Nor can it be found anywhere else.

- (103) Something that is not the body nor something else,Neither co-mingled, nor separate in any way,Is not a [truly existent] thing at all. Because of that,Sentient beings are released in natural nirvana.
- (104) If the cognition [of something] exists prior to the object of cognition,

Then on what does it focus to arise?
And if a cognition and the object of cognition are simultaneous,
[Still] on what does it focus to arise?

(105) Yet, if it occurs after the object of cognition, Then from what does the cognition [of it] arise?

# (4) "SELFLESSNESS OF PHENOMENA" IN RELATION TO CLOSE PLACEMENT OF MINDFULNESS OF PHENOMENA

A [truly existent] arising of any phenomenon Cannot be determined.

## REJECTING THE OBJECTION THAT THE TWO TRUTHS ARE UNTENABLE

(106) [Suppose you object]

"But if it were the case that conventional truth does not exist [at all]

Then how can there be two truths?

Moreover, if conventionalities [arise by means of] other [power],

Then how can sentient beings transcend sorrow?

(107) [Well] this [mode is by means of] another conceptual [deceptive] mind,

But this is not our mode of conventionality.

If it is ascertained afterwards, it [still] exists;

[And if not] the conventionality does not exist.

(108) Both the conceptual thought and the object of investigation Are mutually dependent.

And by dependence on [worldly] acceptance

All objects of analysis are expressed.

(109) [Suppose you object]

"If the analytical intelligence that

Examines [whether or not an object exists intrinsically]

Is [subject to] examination [in turn],

This leads to an infinite regress.

(110) [Well] when the object of analytical enquiry is being examined.

The analytical enquiry has no basis.

And because of being without a basis, it does not arise:

That is called [natural] nirvana.

(111) For these two to truly [exist] [as the Realists] hold Is hard to maintain.

[Because] if an object is established [as truly existent]

# 38 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE — PART 5 — EDITION 1 by the power of a cognition, Then what is the basis [of reasoning] for the existence of cognition?

(112) And if a cognition is established from [the power of] the object of cognition,Then what is the basis [of reasoning] for [the true] existence of the object of cognition?Their existence [is established] by the power of mutual [dependence],Which entails that both would be not [truly] existent.

(113) [For example] if [a man] without a child is not a father,[Then] by whom is a child sired?[Because] in the absence of a child, there can be no father.Again, the two [subject/object] are not [truly] existent.

(114) [Suppose you ask]"A sprout grows from a seed,And just as [the true existence of] the seed is indicated by the [sprout],By the arising of a cognition from the object of cognition,Why cannot its [true] existence [also] be realised?"

(115) [Well] if [the seed is realised by] a cognitionDifferent from [the sprout]By what [reasoning] is [the true] existence of the cognitionWhich is inferred through its apprehension of an object established?

#### LOGIC THAT ESTABLISHES "EMPTINESS"

#### (A) REASONING FROM THE VIEWPOINT OF CAUSE

#### (1) REJECTING CAUSELESS PRODUCTION

(116) [Charvakas assert]: By direct perception of the conventional world.

All causes are seen.

[After all] the diverse parts of [anything] like a lotus stalks and so forth -

Grow by means of diverse causes.

(117) Suppose [you ask],

"What has produced [those] diverse causes?"

[Well] a diversity of previous causes.

And [suppose you ask further], "Why does a cause have the ability to give rise to an effect?"

[Well] due to the power of previous causes.

## (2) REJECTING PRODUCTION FROM PERMANENT CAUSES

- (118) If [as the Nyaya-Vaisheshikas assert] [the Powerful Lord] Ishvara were the cause of the world, Tell me, what is Ishvara in fact? If you say, "The elements," then so be it, But why [all] the fuss over a mere name?
- (119) However, earth and the rest have multiple parts, Are impermanent, inanimate and not divine; Trod on and unclean. So these cannot be the [Powerful Lord] Ishvara.
- (120) Ishvara cannot be space, because [space] is a non-impelling [force].

He cannot be the self, since that has been refuted before.

#### 40 | Nalanda Masters Course - Part 5 - Edition 1

And even [if you say], "He is the creator which is inconceivable,"

Well then, what is the use of discussing the inconceivable?

(121) And what could it be that he wished to create? The self? Well, are not [the self], the earth and the rest [of the elements],

And Ishvara supposed to be eternal by nature? Cognition arises from the object of cognition.

(122) Happiness and suffering have arisen since beginningless [time] from karma.

So tell me, what has been created [by Ishvara]? And if there is no beginning to the cause, How can there be a beginning to the effect?

- (123) And why does he not create continually
  Since he does not depend on anything else?
  If nothing exists that was not created by him,
  On what does he depend [in order to create]?
- (124) If [the creation] depends [on other conditions], the collection [of the conditions] would be the cause, And not Ishvara.

[For] when [the conditions] are gathered, no power can impede the creation.

And in their absence, [Ishvara] has no power to create.

(125) And if [the Powerful Lord] Ishvara must create lacking a wish to [create],

It absurdly follows that he is under the compulsion of something else.

While if [creation is done] when he "wants" then he is under the power of "want."

So how is he "Ishvara" [the Powerful Lord], when creations are done that way?

(126) Those [Mimamsakas] who assert particles to be the permanent [creator]

Have already been disproved above.

While the Samkhyas assert

Permanent Primal Substance as the cause of the world.

- (3) REJECTING PRODUCTION FROM "PERMANENT PRIMAL SUBSTANCE"
- (127) [For Samkhyas] the universal constituents,
  [Known as] courage [sattva, pleasure], particles [rajas, pain],
  and darkness [tamas, neutral sensation]
  When abiding in balance are called Primal Substance;
  [While their] imbalance is said to be the
  migrators/[manifestations].
- (128) But it is illogical for a [partless] unity to have a threefold nature;

Therefore, it does not exist.

Likewise, the universal constituents cannot be [truly] existent, Because each of them also has three aspects.

(129) And in the absence of the universal constituents, The [true] existence of sound and the rest becomes very farfetched.

Moreover, it is impossible for pleasure and so on To exist in non-sentient clothing and the like.

(130) If functional things are of the nature of their causes.[Well] have not functional things already been analyzed?[In any case] the causes for you are the very pleasure and so on;

- 42 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE PART 5 EDITION 1

  But cotton clothing and the like do not arise from those.
- (131) And, pleasure and so on arise from cotton clothing and the like,Then since these do not exist, pleasure and so on do not exist.Moreover, even the permanence of pleasure and so on Has never been seen.
- (132) If manifest pleasure and so on are [truly] existent,Why is [their] experience not perceived?[Suppose you say] "the [experience] turns into a subtle [state]",[Well] how can it be [both] gross and subtle?
- (133) If it becomes subtle [and non-manifest] after having left its gross [manifest] state,These gross and subtle states are impermanent.So why not acceptAll functional things as impermanent?
- (134) And if the gross [manifest] state is no different from pleasure [itself],
  Then the manifest pleasure is impermanent.
  Suppose you assert, "But something totally nonexistent [in the cause]
  Could not be produced, because of its being non-existent."
- (135) Even if you do not accept the production of an evident phenomenon,Still this is actually the case.And if an effect exists in its cause,Then consuming food would be eating excrement!
- (136) And [why not buy] and wear cotton seed [for less cost than] the price of cotton clothing?

Suppose [you say], "[Although] common people do not see [it], because of ignorance, That is precisely the position [Established] by [Kapila] the Knower of Reality."

- (137) [Well] cognition of that must [also] exist In common people, so why do [they] not see it? Suppose [you answer] "[Because] common people are not valid cognizers [of that]." [Well then] what they see as manifest [also] is not true.
- (138) [Suppose you retort], "[But you too assert that] a valid cognizer [for the common world] is not a valid cognizer. Then wouldn't what was cognized by it [also] become false, And therefore, in actuality, meditation on the emptiness [Of functional phenomena] becomes untenable?"
- (139) Without having identified the object of [negation] which is imputation, The absence of that object cannot be apprehended. Therefore, whatever is a false object lacks entity, Which clearly indicates its falsity.
- (140) Thus, upon the death of a child in a dream, The conceptual thought, 'He does not exist' Is a hindrance to [thinking of] his existence. And yet that ['the child does not exist'] is false.

#### SUMMARY

(141) Therefore, when analysed in that way, Nothing exists causelessly. [Things] do not exist in their conditions, Whether individually or collectively.

#### 44 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE - PART 5 - EDITION 1

(142) [A thing] does not emerge from something else;Does not abide nor does it go.[So] any thing viewed as truly existent by ignorance,How is it different from an illusion?

# (B) REASONING OF DEPENDENT ORIGINATION TO ESTABLISH THE VIEW OF "SELFLESSNESS"

(143) [So for] any thing emanated by a magician,Or any thing emanated by causes:[[if what is produced exists intrinsically then examine] where it comes from.And also where it goes,

(144) How can there be true existenceIn some virtual object like a reflection,Which is seen [only] in conjunction with something [else]And which does not exist when that is absent?

# (C) REASONING TO ESTABLISH "EMPTINESS" FROM THE VIEWPOINT OF EFFECT

(145) For a functional thing that is existent,What need is there for a cause?Then again, if that is not existent,What need is there for a cause?

(146) There can be no transformation of a non-existent thing [into an existent thing],Even by means of a hundred million causes!How can a thing in that state [of non-existence] become an [existent] thing?But what else could be transformed into [an existent] functional thing?

(147) Since functional things cannot possibly exist at the time

of the absence of functional [things].
When will they come to exist as functional things?
Without production of a functional thing,
[A non-thing] cannot be freed from being a non-functional

(148) Without being freed from non-functional things,No occasion will occur for a functional thing to exist.And a functional thing cannot change to a state of non-functionality,Because [then] it would absurdly follow that it had two true natures.

(149) In that way, as cessation does not [truly] exist,And [the arising] of functional things does not [truly] exist either,All wandering beings at all timesNever are [truly] arising nor [truly] ceasing.

#### SAMENESS OF SAMSARA AND NIRVANA ON THE ULTIMATE LEVEL

(150) [Therefore] wandering beings resemble dreams. Upon analysis, they are like plantain trees. Whether they are released or not from sorrow Ultimately, there is no difference.

#### ADVICE ON THE NEED TO STRIVE TO REALISE EMPTINESS

## (A) WHAT IS THE REALITY?

thing.

(151) With all phenomena empty in that way,What is there to gain?What is there to lose?Who is there to respect or scorn?

(152) From where does pleasure or pain arise?

#### 46 | Nalanda Masters Course - Part 5 - Edition 1

What is there to dislike or like?
When investigated at the ultimate level
What [object] is craved by which [agent]?

- (153) Upon analysis, [what] world of living beings [is there]
  That will die here?
  Who is there who will come into existence?
  Who is there who has existed?
  Who is a relative? [Who is] a friend?
- (154) Those of my type, please understand That everything is like space.

#### (B) DRAWBACKS OF SAMSARA

But those wishing for happiness for a "self" Get agitated and overexcited

- (155) Through causes [such as] fights and festivities;
  Then from the [resulting] distress and over-exertion, and
  [Disheartening] disputes, they cut and stab each other.
  Thus passing their lives in tremendous difficulties due to
  [their] negative deeds.
- (156) Then, [despite] coming to the favourable states of birth over and over again, andSo often experiencing manifold pleasures,After death, they fall to [experience]The unbearable sufferings of the bad states of birth for a very long time.
- (157) In [cyclic] existence, cliffs [to fall from] are aplenty;
  And there [in samsara], one remains deprived of
  [the understanding] of reality

But since [samsara and nirvana] mutually contradict one another, [one unceasingly cycles in Samsara] In [cyclic] existence, nothing [compares with] the realisation of the reality.

- (158) There, too, are incomparable and unbearable Oceans of suffering beyond any end; In [samsara], there is little strength; The life span is too short.
- (159) There, as well, with activities for longevity and health, With hunger and exhaustion, With sleep and harms, and likewise With fruitlessly keeping company with childish people,
- (160) Life passes quickly and in vain. Yet, analytical wisdom is so difficult to gain! Furthermore, where is there [in samsara] a means To eliminate the habituated distractions?
- (161) Again, [when making effort to be free], the demon is striving there To bring about a fall to the most awful states of rebirth. [In higher births, because] there are too many false paths, Also it is difficult to transcend "doubt."
- (162) And it is difficult to gain respite again, And the appearance of a Buddha is extremely difficult to find, And the rapids of disturbing emotion are so difficult to abandon. Alas, suffering will just go on unceasingly.
- (163) And they fail to see their own suffering, Although they are infested with extreme suffering. Oh dear, this really is the cause to lament

- 48 | NALANDA MASTERS COURSE PART 5 EDITION 1

  For those who are caught in the rapids of suffering
- (164) For example, some people perform ablutions and ablutions,Then they jump into fire again and again,Even though in terrible states of suffering,They believe themselves to be happy.
- (165) Likewise, there are those who frolic about,[Fooling around], as if there were no old age and death.First, they will lose their lives,And then fall to a worse state of rebirth.

#### THE MODE OF APPREHENSION OF THE GREAT COMPASSION

- (166) Oh! When shall I come to bring peaceTo those tormented by the fires of suffering like these?With a rain happiness from my collection,Pouring forth from the clouds of my merit?
- (167) Oh! When shall [I] intensely accumulate the store of merit
  Through [insight into] the emptiness of the [object] of
  apprehension,
  And then teach emptiness to those
  Who have been ruined by [such] an object of apprehension.

#### \*\*\*\*

This rendering of the Ninth, Wisdom chapter of Shantideva's Guide to the Bodhisattva's Way of Life was prepared by Geshe Dorji Damdul with editing assistance from Jeremy Russell and Ven. Tenzin Nordron for the March and August 2006 teachings by His Holiness the Dalai Lama at Thekchen Chöling. This text is based on and indebted to an earlier translation by Dr Alex Berzin.

## RESPECT FOR SACRED BOOKS

The Dharma of the Buddha is the true source of happiness for all sentient beings. Books like this one are repositories of the words and guides of great adepts, showing us how to put the teachings into practice and integrate them into our lives, whereby we can gain the happiness we seek and become a source of comfort and happiness for others. Therefore, books containing Dharma teachings are more precious than other material objects and should be treated with utmost respect.

Do not treat them casually like other objects or put them underneath other things, step over them, sit on them, or use them for mundane purposes, such as propping up tables, chairs and so on. They should be wrapped in cloth when carried and always be kept in a clean, high place, separate from writings on worldly subjects.

For more information, please contact

र्वेर्'किर'।

## TIBET HOUSE

1, Institutional Area, Lodhi Road, New Delhi - 110003, INDIA E-Mail: office@tibethouse.in , masterscourse@tibethouse.in Tel: +91-11-2461-1515 Mobile No.: +91-844-721-8959 Website: www.tibethouse.in